

STATE OF KUWAIT

Ministry of Planning

**Kuwait: Country Report on the Millennium
Development Goals: Achievements and Challenges**

April, 2003

Kuwait: Country Report on the Millennium Development Goals: Achievements and Challenges

I. Introduction and Background:

1. According to the United Nations (UN) the “development goals set out in the Millennium Declaration express the resolve of the world’s political leaders to free their fellow men, women and children from the abject and dehumanizing conditions of extreme poverty, to make the right to development a reality for everyone, and to free the entire human race from want”¹. In the UN analysis the world is divided in such a way that one sixth of humanity has achieved levels of well-being that are very affluent by any standard. At the other extreme, another one sixth of humanity “struggles for daily survival, in a life-and-death battle against disease, hunger and environmental catastrophe”. An estimated four billion people live in between these two extremes of affluence and poverty, but their standards of living are judged to be relatively far below those enjoyed by the affluent group of countries.

2. The above distribution of the peoples of the world implicitly uses per capita consumption expenditure (or per capita GDP) as a measure of well-being, despite the various reservations about the appropriateness of such a measure. On the basis of such measure of well-being Kuwait is fortunate to belong to the group of countries that enjoys a very affluent standard of living². In 1996 purchasing power parity dollars, the 1996 per capita GDP for Kuwait is reported as US\$23386 comparable to the average GDP per capita income of five European countries which amounted to US\$23665³.

3. As is well known Kuwait is a small country with a total population in 2001 of 2.243 million. Of these 0.855 million are Kuwaitis while 1.387 million are non-Kuwaitis. The non-Kuwaitis dominate the labor force. In 2001 the total labor force is reported as being 1.214 million 80% of which were non-Kuwaitis. Most of the Kuwaiti labor force, 93%, works in the government sector while most of the non-Kuwaiti labor force, 90%, works in the non-government sector (inclusive of 28% working in the household sector). A major feature of the economy is its very low

¹ See UN (2002), Implementation of the United Nations Millennium Declaration: Report of the Secretary-General; report no. A/57/270; page 8; www.un.org.

² As is well known Kuwait is a rich oil country. It accounts for about 9.2% of the world proved reserves estimated at the end of 2000 as 1035.5 billion barrels.

³ These are reported in the famous Pen World Tables data base (www.pwt.econ.upenn.edu). The European countries are Denmark (with the highest GDP per capita among the five countries of US\$26608), France, Germany, Netherlands and UK (with the lowest GDP per capita among the five countries of US\$22190).

unemployment rates for the Kuwaitis, 1%, and non-Kuwaitis 0.7% with an overall unemployment rate of 0.8%⁴.

4. Despite its affluence Kuwait is also classified as a developing country. As such it is expected to report on progress achieved in realizing the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Country reports on the MDGs are expected to provide an input into the UN Secretary-General's global report on MDG progress in 2005. The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) is the designated coordinating agency on monitoring progress towards achieving the goals in collaboration with UN agencies, other UN partners, the World Bank, the IMF and OECD. The main purpose of the collaboration is to ensure a common assessment and understanding of the status of the MDGs at both the global and national levels.

5. Earlier collaboration between the various international organizations has already helped in the formulation of the Millennium Development Goals in 1996 where OECD took the lead in formulating the International Development Goals (IDGs), and in the selection of the indicators suitable for monitoring purposes. The MDGs and their indicators are summarized in annex table (A.1)⁵.

6. As can be seen from the annex table (A.1) for each goal a number of indicators are identified. The key to an appropriate methodology to be used for assessing progress towards achieving the goals is to be found in the foreword to the report entitled "A Better World for All". The "foreword" is signed by the representatives of the international community: Mr. Kofi Annan, the Secretary-General of the United Nations (UN); Mr. Donald J. Johnston, the Secretary-General of the Organization for Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD); Mr. Horst Kohler, the Managing Director of the International Monetary Fund (IMF); and Mr. James D. Wolfenson, the President of the World Bank Group. In the foreword the representatives of the international community noted that the "goals are set in precise terms- measured in numbers to ensure accountability. The openness and transparency of such numbers can help us chart a course to achieve the goals and track progress. But people are not numbers- happiness is not a statistic. These goals are worthwhile because they will improve the quality of human life"⁶.

7. The current dominant methodology for assessing progress towards achieving the goals involves comparing the required rates of change in the various quantitative indicators required to achieve the goals with actual performance since 1990. This can be done by the direct calculation of the rates in question or alternatively by estimating trend equations⁷. Direct calculation for all indicators that are to be halved between

⁴ These figures are taken from the Ministry of Planning, (2001), "The Basic Features of Population and Labor Force as in 30/6/2001", Kuwait.

⁵ The summary of the MDGs presented in annex table (A.1) is based on UN (2002), Implementation of the United Nations Millennium Declaration: Report on the Secretary-General; report no. A/57/270; www.un.org.

⁶ The report can be downloaded from the website: www.paris21.org/betterworld. It should be noted that the goals in the report were known at the time as the International Development Goals (IDGs) that became the MDGs in 2000.

⁷ Direct calculation for the required rates of change in a given indicator, call it MDI, can be done using the standard formula: $MDI(2015) = MDI(1990) [1 + r]^{25}$, where r is the rate of change. As usual r can

1990 and 2015, a time horizon of 25 years, show that the indicators in question are expected to record an annual decline at a rate of 2.74 percent. For indicators that are to be reduced by two thirds over the 25 years period the annual rate of reduction is 4.34 percent while for indicators that are to be reduced by three quarters implying an annual rate of decline is 5.39 percent. Actual rates of change of the various indicators recorded during the 1990s can be compared with these required rates of change to assess progress made and the feasibility of attaining the MDGs by 2015.

8. In section (2) of this report, using the methodology noted above, progress towards achieving the MDGs in Kuwait will be presented. The section is organized in such a manner that its sub-sections deal with the analysis of each goal. Details of the information used for Kuwait are provided in annex table (A.2) with the sources used to compile this information given in annex table (A.3). Given the basic feature of the dominance of the non-Kuwaiti population in the country, and given the fact that this group is dynamically changing and that their characteristics relevant to the indicators are shaped by their countries of origin, the MDG indicators are usually available for the Kuwaiti population. As such, therefore, the analysis that follows is mainly couched in terms of the relevant indicators for the Kuwaiti population. Section (3) of highlights the challenges that remain to be dealt with by Kuwait. For those interested in comparing the performance of Kuwait with average countries in various regions of the developing world annex table (A.4) provides such information, though the relevant comparison may be that with the developed countries. No such comparison is provided in the text.

II. Progress and Achievements in Kuwait:

Goal 1: Eradicating Extreme Poverty and Hunger:

9. The first Millennium Development Goal (MDG) is to eradicate extreme poverty and hunger. Two major targets under this goal have been specified. The first target is to halve the proportion of people living in extreme poverty (living on less than US\$1.08 per person per day) by the year 2015. As is well known, the proportion of people living in extreme poverty is the head count ratio while the income level of US\$ 1.08 per person per day is the poverty line. Three indicators have been selected to reflect progress in achieving this target. These include the head-count ratio itself, the poverty gap ratio and the share of the poorest 20 percent of the population in national consumption (i.e. the share of the poorest quintile)⁸. The second target is to halve the

be solved for by the logarithmic transformation of the above equation such that: $\log \{MDI(2015)/MDI(1990)\} = 25 \log [1 + r]$. For actual performance the same procedure can be used where the year 2015 is replaced by the latest year for which information is available and appropriately changing the number of years in the equation. The base year 1990 can also be replaced by an actual base year for which information is available. In the case of Kuwait 1993 is used as the appropriate base year for judging performance during the 1990s. The alternative to direct calculation for judging performance during the 1990s is to estimate a trend equation for the indicator in question over the period under consideration. The trend equation can take the form $\ln (MDI_t) = \alpha + \beta T$, where \ln is the natural logarithm, T is time and the subscript t refers to the year for which the indicator is observed. As is well known β is the rate of change of the indicator. The advantage of estimating trend equations is that they enable a judgment as to whether the observed trend is statistically significant.

⁸ For a given poverty line, z , the head-count ratio, H , is defined as the number of people with consumption expenditure equal to or less than the poverty line, q , as a ratio of total population, n . Thus,

proportion of people who suffer from hunger by the year 2015. Two indicators have been selected to monitor progress with respect to this target. These are the prevalence of underweight children under five years of age; and, the proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption.

10. Regarding the first target, and as noted in the introduction, Kuwait is a rich country with a real per capita GDP almost equal to the average of advanced countries. Further confirmation of the level of affluence enjoyed by Kuwait is provided by the detailed information made available in the latest Household Income and Expenditure Survey for the Year 1999-2000 (HIES). According to the HIES results the average per capita expenditure for the poorest Kuwaitis amounted to KD.108.4 per month, equivalent to US\$353.4 per month or about US\$11.8 per person per day. This means that the average expenditure of the Kuwaiti poor is about ten times higher than the international poverty line of US\$1.08 per person per day. **On the basis of the above it is perhaps reasonable to conclude that as far as income poverty is concerned Kuwait has already eliminated extreme poverty for its citizens.**

11. The third indicator to be used for monitoring progress in reducing income poverty is a variable that relates to relative deprivation as reflected in the share of the poorest 20 percent of the population in national consumption. While it is not clear in the statement of the MDGs how this indicator is to be used for monitoring purposes it is plausible to assume that an increasing time trend is what is desired. Indeed for a rich country like Kuwait it is this share that could be deemed relevant for the purposes of looking at the phenomenon of social exclusion rather than income poverty as such. With this understanding, the time trend in the share of the lowest quintile in consumption expenditure is an indicator of the state of the equality of the distribution of the standard living in the society. Changes in the distribution of income, or consumption, over time are generally considered to be very slow. More problematic is that very few countries have systematic, reasonably spaced, observations on the state of income distribution suitable for monitoring purposes. This is largely due to the expensive nature of conducting expenditure surveys. The remedy for this is to compare the indicator in question for two points in time even if these do not coincide with the years in question invoking the assumption that the distributional changes are insignificant for short periods.

12. In the case of Kuwait the HIES of 1986-1987 could be taken to represent the base year of the MDGs (i.e. 1990). To obtain the share of the lowest quintile in consumption expenditure for Kuwait Lorenz curves were fitted on the HIES data for the 1986-1987 and 1999-2000. The results show that the share of the lowest quintile in the distribution of expenditure for the Kuwaitis was 7.99 percent in 1986/87 and 8.45 percent in 1999/2000⁹. Thus, it can be concluded that over the 1990s the share

$H = q/n$. The poverty gap ratio, P_1 , is defined as the sum of the relative gaps between the income of the poor and the poverty line normalized by total population. It can be shown that $P_1 = H(1 - y/z)$ where y is the average income of the poor.

⁹ Estimates of the Lorenz curves are generated by the POVCAL programme. POVCAL is a programme for calculating poverty measures from grouped data. The programme was developed in the World Bank and can be accessed and downloaded from www.worldbank.org. Two formats for the Lorenz curve are usually estimated using ordinary least squares: a general quadratic format and a Beta format. To appreciate these estimates let P be the cumulative distribution of population and L the corresponding cumulative income distribution. For grouped data the estimating equation for the general quadratic is given by: $L_i(1 - L_i) = a(P_i^2 - L_i) + bL_i(P_i - 1) + c(P_i - L_i)$, where i refers to the reported groups on the

of the lowest quintile among the Kuwaitis has increased indicating an improvement in the distribution of expenditure.

Goal 2: Achieving Universal Primary Education:

13. Under this goal only one target is specified. The target requires that by 2015 children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling. Three indicators for the achievement of this goal have been identified. These are the net enrolment ratio in primary education; the proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5; and the literacy rate of those aged 15-24 years.

14. Net enrolment ratio in primary education was 87.4% in 1994 and declined to 85.8% in 2000 after having increased to 89.1% in 1998. No systematic trend could be observed. The ratio increased up to 1996, declined in 1997 and declined again in 1999 and 2000. Over the period where the ratio registered an increase the annual rate of increase was 0.47 percent. The estimated trend rate of decline of 0.04 percent per annum is not statistically significant¹¹. Starting from 2000 the achievement of the MDG target would require an annual rate of increase of the primary enrolment ratio of 1.03 percent. **Given the experience of the second half of the 1990s the achievement of the goal of universal primary education by 2015 represents a challenge facing Kuwait.**

15. The proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5 was 94.8% in 1994 and increased to 95.6% in 2002, fluctuating over the period with high values of 97.9% recorded for 1997 and 2001. Over the period 1994 and 2001 the annual rate of increase of the ratio is 0.47 percent. The estimated annual trend growth rate is 0.21 percent that is not statistically significant. Starting with 2000 as a base year the achievement of the target will require an annual rate of increase of 0.25 percent.

basis of which the cumulative distribution is generated. In the estimation all groups, except the last one are used. The estimating equation for the Beta Lorenz curve is: $\text{Ln}(P_i - L_i) = a + b \text{Ln} P_i + c \text{Ln}(1 - P_i)$, where Ln is the natural logarithm. In the case of Kuwait the Beta Lorenz curve fitted the data better for 1986 distribution and for the overall distribution for 1999. The general quadratic Lorenz curve fitted the data better for 1999 for the Kuwaitis and non-Kuwaitis distributions.

¹⁰ The estimated Lorenz curves for the Kuwaiti distributions are given in the table below (in percentages):

Quintile	1986	1999
Poorest Quintile	7.99	8.46
Second Quintile	12.29	12.26
Third Quintile	16.51	16.13
Fourth Quintile	22.25	21.45
Richest Quintile	40.97	41.69
Gini Coefficient	32.85	31.47

¹¹ The estimated trend equation is: $\text{Ln NPER} = 4.48 - 0.00038 T$; where Ln is the natural logarithm, NPER is the primary enrolment ratio, and T is time. $R^2 = 0.005$; $n = 7$; and t-values for the intercept and time trend coefficient are respectively 392 and -0.15.

Given the experience of the second half of the 1990s the achievement of the goal of universal primary education by 2015 represents a challenge facing Kuwait.

16. The literacy rate of those aged 15-24 years was 98.4 percent in 1993 and increased in a systematic fashion to 99.82 percent in 2002 recording an annual rate of increase of 0.16 percent. The trend growth rate is estimated as 0.18 percent per annum and it is statistically significant¹². **Both in terms of the achieved level of this indicator as well as its trend growth rate it seems fair to conclude that the MDG indicator on literacy has already been achieved by Kuwait nearly 13 years ahead of time.**

Goal 3: Promoting Gender Equality and Empowering Women:

17. Under this goal only one target is specified. The target requires the elimination of gender disparity in primary and secondary education by 2005 and in all levels of education by 2015. Four indicators for the achievement of this goal have been identified. These are the ratio of girls to boys in the three levels of education; the ratio of literate females to males of 15-24 years old; the share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector; and, the proportion of seats held by women in the national parliament.

18. **Detailed information on the ratio of girls to boys in the three conventional levels of education over the period 1993-2000 show that Kuwait was able to achieve the goal of gender equality in education by 2000, fifteen years ahead of the terminal year of the MDGs.** The ratio of girls to boys in basic education hovered around 99.5%, recorded for 1997 as the lowest for the period under consideration, and 100.5%, recorded for 2000 as the highest. For secondary education the ratio of girls to boys recorded its lowest value of 107.2% in 1996 and its highest value of 120.2% in 2000. For tertiary education the ratio of girls to boys is embarrassingly high in excess of 200% for the whole period starting with 216% for 1993 and reaching 227.5% in 2000. As a result of these achievements it is perhaps not surprising to find that the ratio of literate females to males of 15-24 years old has also been achieved by the year 2000. The ratio in question hovered around 99% for most of the years under consideration increasing from about 97% in 1993 to 99.24% in 2000. For the year 2002 the ratio increased further to 99.5%. **Thus, judging gender equality by the relevant ratios in education and literacy Kuwait was able to achieve the MDG in the year 2000, fifteen years ahead of the target year of the MDGs.**

19. The share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector is an indicator of the economic empowerment of women. In 1993 this share was 30.96% and increased in a systematic fashion to reach 37.33% in 2002 registering an annual rate of increase of 2.1 percent. The estimated annual trend growth rate of the share of women in wage employment is 1.96 percent that is statistically significant¹³. If gender

¹² The estimated trend equation is: $\text{Ln LITR} = 4.59 + 0.0018 T$; where Ln is the natural logarithm and T is time. $R^2 = 0.98$; $n = 9$; and t-values for the intercept and time trend coefficient are respectively 8314 and 18.3.

¹³ The estimated trend equation is: $\text{Ln SWWE} = 3.40 + 0.0196 T$; where SWWE is the indicator in question and T is time. $R^2 = 0.98$; $n = 9$; and t-values for the intercept and time trend coefficient are respectively 508 and 18.1.

equality in terms of the economic empowerment of women is interpreted as requiring that the share of women in non-agricultural employment becomes 50% then the required annual rate of increase to achieve this target is 2.27 percent. The currently achieved rate of increase of the indicator is about 0.86 of the required rate of increase. **Given this performance, it seems reasonable to argue that the achievement of the goal of the economic empowerment of women represents a challenge for Kuwait, albeit an easily surmountable one.**

20. As is well known Kuwait was a democracy since its independence in 1961. It has a one chamber national parliament, the National Assembly, the members of which are periodically elected in free, open and fair elections according to the relevant laws and regulations for such electoral processes. Given cultural and historical factors, however, these elections are based not on universal suffrage¹⁴. Women are excluded from the political process. **As such, therefore, the proportion of seats held by women in the Kuwait National Assembly has been zero since independence. Despite this, and because of the open political system, the struggle for the political empowerment women has been going on and is expected to come to fruition before the target year of 2015.** Caution, however, needs to be exercised in dealing with this indicator in the sense that even if women were allowed to contest elections there exists no guarantee that women would automatically win seats in the National Assembly once they are granted election and voting rights. Indeed, there exists no guarantees that even when they win seats that their share in the national parliament would increase over time. Cultural factors and political dynamics are involved in the determination of the results of competitive elections. **Needless to note that, given the above, the political empowerment of women constitutes a challenge to Kuwait.**

Goal 4: Reducing Child Mortality:

21. Under this goal only one target is specified. The target requires the reduction of the under-five mortality rate by two thirds between 1990 and 2015. Three indicators have been identified for the achievement of this goal. These are the under-five mortality rate; the infant mortality rate; and the proportion of one year olds children who are immunized against measles.

22. The under-five mortality rate in Kuwait is estimated as about 11.5 per thousand in 2001. In 1993 the rate was 13 per thousand with an increasing trend up to 1997 when it reached 15.3 per thousand before beginning to decline. For the whole period 1993-2001 the trend is one of decline at an annual rate of 2.37 percent and the rate of decline is significantly different from zero¹⁵. The target under-five mortality rate for the year 2015 in the case of Kuwait is 4.03 per thousand. Starting from the currently achieved mortality rate this will require an annual rate of decline of this indicator of 4.54 percent which is almost double the actual rate of decline. **Given the already low**

¹⁴ For a brief historical account of democracy in Kuwait, and the Constitution, see the National Assembly website: www.alommah.gov.kw.

¹⁵ The estimated trend equation is: $\ln U5-MR = 2.65 - 0.0237 T$; where \ln is the natural logarithm and T is time. $R^2 = 0.393$; $n = 9$; and t -values for the intercept and time trend coefficient are respectively 42.3 and -2.13.

under-five mortality rate future progress on this indicator will probably depend on advances in medical sciences.

23. The infant mortality rate in Kuwait is estimated as 9.5 per thousand in 2001 declining from a rate of 11.2 per thousand in 1993, thus recording an annual rate of decline of 3.75 percent. The trend of this indicator over the period 1993-2001 has been one of decline with an annual rate of decline of 3.4 percent that is statistically significant¹⁶. Starting from the base year of 1993 the target infant mortality rate is about 4.26 per thousand. The achievement of the target infant mortality rate requires an annual rate of decline of 4.92 percent, slightly higher than the recorded rate of decline. **Given the already achieved low infant mortality rates, and the relatively high rates of decline achieved during the period 1993-2001, Kuwait seems to be poised to achieve this goal though future progress will probably depend on advances in medical sciences.**

24. The proportion of one year olds children who are immunized against measles is estimated as 99.1% in 2000 while that in 1994 was 95.4%, thus recording an annual rate of increase of 0.53 percent. The overall time trend for this indicator over the period 1994-2000 is one of increase at a rate of 0.23 percent per annum, but the rate is not statistically significant¹⁷. **In general, however, Kuwait seems to be on the verge of complete immunization coverage of the one year old children.**

25. On the basis of the above observations it seems reasonable to conclude that reducing the currently fairly low under-five mortality rate by two thirds by the year 2015 is a feasible objective to achieve especially in view of the advances in medical sciences and medical technology.

Goal 5: Improving Maternal Health:

26. Under this goal only one target is specified. The target requires the reduction of maternal mortality rate by three-quarters between 1990 and 2015. Two indicators are identified for the achievement of this goal. These are the maternal mortality rate and the proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel.

27. The maternal mortality rate is recorded as zero for the years 1993 and 1994 as well as for the years 2000 and 2001. For the period 1995-1999 the maternal mortality rate increased from 7.6 women per 100,000 live births for 1995 and 1996 to 11.4 in 1997 before declining to 3.9 women per 100,000 live births for 1998 and 1999. Starting from 1999, by 2015 Kuwait is required to attain a maternal mortality rate of about 1 woman per 100,000 live births. To achieve this the 1999 maternal mortality rate is required to decline at annual rate of 7.83 per cent. However, noting that Kuwait has already achieved zero maternal mortality in the early 1990s and the years 2000 and 2001, it seems reasonable to argue that the indicator can be achieved by the

¹⁶ The estimated trend equation is: $\text{Ln IMR} = 2.52 - 0.0338 T$; $R^2 = 0.56$, $n = 9$; and the t-values for the intercept and time trend coefficient are respectively 39.6 and -2.99.

¹⁷ The estimated trend equation is: $\text{Ln [Ratio of Measles Immunized One Year Olds]} = 4.56 + 0.0023T$; $R^2 = 0.08$; and t-values for the intercept term and the time trend coefficient are respectively 278.8 and 0.64, and $n = 7$.

designated date by a determined effort to maintain the 2000 levels of the indicator. The proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel is estimated as 100% and has been achieved since 1993 or possibly earlier. **On the basis of these observations it is perhaps clear that the goal on maternal health has already been achieved in Kuwait.**

Goal 6: Combating HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases:

28. Under this goal two targets are specified. The first target requires the halting, and the eventual reversal, of the spread of HIV/AIDS by 2015 while the second target requires the halting, and the eventual reversal, of malaria and other diseases by 2015. For measuring progress towards the achievement of the first target three indicators are identified. These are the HIV prevalence rate among 15-24 year old pregnant women; the condom use rate in the contraceptive prevalence rate¹⁸; and the number of children orphaned by HIV/AIDS. For the achievement of the second target four indicators are identified. These are the prevalence and death rates associated with malaria; the proportion of population in malaria risk areas using effective malaria prevention and treatment measures; the prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis; and, the proportion of TB cases detected and cured under directly observed treatment short courses (DOTS).

29. The indicators relating to the HIV/AIDS target are not readily available for Kuwait. However, the epidemiological fact sheet for Kuwait in the UNAIDS website provides an assessment for the situation in 2002¹⁹. These fact sheets are prepared by UNAIDS and WHO in collaboration with national governments and research institutions. According to this source since 1992 a sample of 500 to 800 pregnant women are tested yearly and no evidence of HIV infection among this group has been found. In 2000 all of the 417 pregnant women who were screened have tested negative while the HIV seroprevalence rate among blood donors was found to be 0.01 and only one patient with sexually transmitted disease (STD) has tested positive out of 417 STD cases. It is also reported that while in 1993 and 1996 one percent of intravenous (IV) drug users tested were positive none was found for the year 2000 out of 193 IV drug users. In 1999 four HIV positive infections were detected among 764 tested prisoners, no HIV positive case was found in 2000 out of 1503 prisoners who were screened. **On the basis of this evidence it seems fair to conclude that Kuwait was able to protect its citizens from the spread of HIV/AIDS.**

30. Regarding the second target related to malaria and other diseases it should be noted that Kuwait is a malaria-free country and as such the two indicators relating to malaria are recorded as zero. Similarly, the prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis are zero.

¹⁸ The UN notes that among contraceptive methods, only condoms are effective in preventing HIV transmission. Note also that the condom use rate is measured for women in a union and depending on cultural factors it can be a very difficult rate to estimate. It is also expected that in the future that the indicator will be supplemented by a indicator on condom use rate in high risk situations and an indicator of knowledge and misconceptions regarding HIV/AIDS by those aged 15-24 years.

¹⁹ See UNAIDS et al (2002), Kuwait: Epidemiological Fact Sheets on HIV/AIDS and Sexually Transmitted Infections: 2002 Update; www.unaids.org.

31. On the basis of the above observations it seems reasonable to suggest that Kuwait should be able to combat HIV/AIDS not only by 2015 but also in a continuous fashion.

Goal 7: Ensuring Environmental Sustainability:

32. Under this goal three targets are specified. The first requires the integration of the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources. Five indicators are identified for measuring progress in achieving this target. These are the proportion of land area covered by forest; land area protected to maintain biological diversity; GDP per unit of energy use to proxy energy efficiency, per capita carbon dioxide emissions, and the proportion of population using solid fuels. The second target requires the halving of the proportion of people without access to sustainable access to safe drinking water by 2015. For the achievement of this target only one indicator is identified which is the proportion of population with sustainable access to an improved water source. The third target is a global one requiring the achievement of significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers by the year 2020. For the achievement of this global target two indicators are identified: the proportion of people with access to improved sanitation; and, the proportion of people with access to secure tenure.

33. The target regarding the integration of the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes was achieved in Kuwait in 1995 when the Environment Public Authority (EPA) was established by law number 21 of 1995 as amended by law number 16 of 1996. EPA is charged with the protection of the environment. The legislation establishing EPA has given it a fairly high profile requiring the supreme council of the authority to be chaired by the First Deputy Prime Minister. Two of the four indicators identified for this target do not seem to be relevant to Kuwait. According to international classification, given the geographical location of the country as well as its size, the proportion of land area covered by forests is zero and land area protected to maintain biological diversity is negligible as a proportion of the total area of the country²⁰.

34. The third indicator, GDP per unit of energy use, is measured as kilogram oil equivalent per \$1000 GDP in purchasing power parity. In the case of Kuwait this measure is calculated using 1995 constant dollars. According to these estimates the indicator recorded a systematic increase up to 1998 from 355 kilograms in 1993 to 569 kilograms in 1998 before declining to 523 kilograms in 1999. A statistically significant trend growth rate of 7.71 percent is estimated²¹.

35. The fourth indicator, per capita carbon dioxide emissions, increased from about 19 tons per capita in 1993 to about 26 tons per capita in 1998 in a systematic fashion.

²⁰ See <http://geodata.grid.unep.ch>. In terms of protection of biological diversity national designations include 3 marine parks, one national park, 14 nature reserves, 4 protected areas, 2 parks and one scientific reserve. Presumably the proportion of the total area covered by these national designations is negligible.

²¹ The estimated trend equation is: $\text{Ln [OEK/GDP]} = 5.84 + 0.0771 T$; $R^2 = 0.82$; number of observations 6, and t-values for the intercept term and the time trend coefficient are respectively 81.5 and 4.81.

The estimated annual trend rate of growth during the period is 1.45 percent that is statistically significant²².

36. The fifth indicator, proportion of population using solid fuels, has been zero for quite a long time on account of the highly urbanized nature of the society as well as on account of the fact that the economy is oil-based implying the availability of non-solid fuels to the population. More important is to note that Kuwait is located in a desert region, with no forests, and hence there exists no significant implication for the use of solid fuels on the environment.

37. The second target requires the halving of the proportion of people without access to sustainable access to safe drinking water by 2015. For the achievement of this target only one indicator is identified which is the proportion of population with sustainable access to an improved water source. Once again given the highly urbanized nature of the society, and the very high standard of living enjoyed by the population, the proportion of population with sustainable access to improved water source has been 100% for a long period of time.

38. The third target on the achievement of significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers by the year 2020 is clearly vaguely formulated and its relevance to Kuwait is probably very limited. Nonetheless, recent information on the distribution of households by type of residence can be interpreted as relevant to the indicator of the proportion of people with access to improved sanitation. Thus according to the Public Authority for Civil Information about 97% of Kuwaiti families were living in premises that have improved sanitation (modern villas, flats, eastern houses or rooms). While the remaining households are classified as living in "other" residences it will be surprising if this "other" category did not have improved sanitation given the state of affluence of the country.

39. Regarding the proportion of people with access to secure tenure about 99.7% of the Kuwaiti households had access to secure tenure as of 31st December 2002. Of these 86.9% were living in houses, 11.6% were living in modern flats and about 1.2% were living in traditional houses and annexes²³.

Goal 8: Global Partnership for Development:

40. Under this goal seven targets are specified. Of the seven only the one dealing with the call for developing an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system is of general applicability. However, due to the vagueness of the target no indicators have been identified to measure progress towards achieving the target. The remaining six targets are group of countries, or world region, specific (e.g. the special needs of least developed countries and landlocked countries) or thematic (dealing with the debt problems of developing countries; and unemployment, drugs and technology use in developing countries). It is noted that indicators for the overall goal of global partnership for development are currently being refined. Currently

²² The estimated trend equation is: $\ln [\text{CO}_2 \text{ emissions per capita}] = 2.29 + 0.0145T$; $R^2 = 0.84$; number of observations 6, and t-values for the intercept term and the time trend coefficient are respectively 183.2 and 5.17.

²³ These figures are based on unpublished information from the Public Authority for Civil Information.

identified targets are 17 in number classified broadly on the basis of official development assistance indicators (5 indicators), market access (4 indicators), debt sustainability (4 indicators), and others (4 indicators).

41. Noting that Kuwait has been a donor country since 1961, it is perhaps reasonable to argue that the most relevant indicator under this goal is that of the ratio of GNP provided as foreign assistance (aid) to other developing countries. Kuwait's aid to developing countries can be classified as official development assistance (ODA) as defined by the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) of OECD. According to available information Kuwait's ODA/GNP ratio was 5% in 1990 but declined in a systematic fashion to 0.6% in 2001 thus recording an annual rate of decline of 42.3 percent per annum. The estimated annual trend rate of decline is 12.24%, which is not statistically significant at conventional levels. Despite this declining trend it should be noted that Kuwait's participation in the process of creating a global partnership for development as a donor is an active and significant one. At 0.6% of GNP in 2001 this ratio is much higher than the average for that of DAC countries of 0.22% of GNP.

42. With respect to this goal it is perhaps important to note that Kuwait has established a specialized development agency since December 1961, the Kuwait Fund for Arab Economic Development (KFAED). From 1974 onwards KFAED extended its operations to other developing countries. As of 1st June 2002 the authorized and paid-up capital of KFAED was US\$6.6 billion with a total loan portfolio of about US\$10.8 billion benefiting 99 countries. The distribution of loans to developing country groups was as follows: 16 Arab countries (with a total of US\$5.8 billion); 18 East and South Asia and the Pacific countries (US\$2.2 billion); 15 Central Asia and European countries (US\$0.71 billion); 19 West African countries (US\$1.03 billion); 10 Latin American and Caribbean countries (US\$0.27 billion); and 21 Central, South and Eastern African countries (US\$0.85 billion)²⁴.

III. Challenges:

43. From the above analysis it is perhaps clear that Kuwait is poised to achieve almost all of the MDGs by the designated year of 2015. Indeed, the analysis has shown that Kuwait has already achieved a number of these goals ahead of time. For a number of goals such an assessment is made easy by the fact that a number of them are specified with one target and one indicator. For some other goals, and for a number of developing countries, an overall assessment would require attaching weights to targets and within targets weights for indicators. In the absence of a multiple weighting scheme only qualitative judgments can be made on the feasibility of attaining the MDGs.

44. Despite the above methodological difficulty it seems reasonable to conclude from the analysis provided in section (2) that the major challenges facing Kuwait have to do with the goal relating to universal primary education, that relating to gender equality and the empowerment of women and the goal dealing with ensuring environmental sustainability.

²⁴ See KAFED, Highlights of the Activities of the Fund: 1st January 1962-30th September 2002; Kuwait. See also <http://www.kuwait-fund.org>.

45. As indicated in the analysis of section (2) the goal on primary education represents a challenge when viewed from the perspective of two of its three indicators, namely the net enrolment ratio and the proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5. The analysis has shown that for these two indicators the actual rates of change achieved during the 1990s was less than the required rates of change to achieve the objective. This suggests that the current efforts on educational reforms aiming at drafting an educational strategy for the country need to take these requirements into account to enable the achievement of the goal in question. With respect to the net enrolment ratio in primary education it is noted that the real challenge relates to a distortion in the age distribution of pupils where some join at earlier ages and others join at older ages. Both are excluded in the calculation of the net enrolment ratio. Thus it is not a question of the coverage of primary education, but rather the age distribution that needs to be monitored in the future.

46. As indicated in the analysis of section (2) the goal on gender equality and the empowerment of women is feasible to achieve by 2015 judging by the education and literacy indicators and by the share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sectors. The remaining challenge has to do with the political empowerment of women. As noted in the analysis Kuwait is fortunate in adopting a democratic governance regime based on a modern constitution. Due to historical, and possibly cultural factors, and despite the freedoms enshrined in the constitution women are not enfranchised with electoral rights. Both the dynamics of the democratic practices in the country and the active political struggle by women in society indicate that this “political deficit” is likely to be corrected before 2015. Thus while there exists no guarantees that the share of women in the National Assembly will increase from its current level, at least the road would be paved for future full participation of women in the political decision making process.

47 As indicated in the analysis of section (2) of the three targets under the goal of ensuring environmental sustainability two have already been achieved. These are the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water and the achievement of significant improvement in the lives of slum dwellers. The challenge remains with respect to the target requiring the integration of the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and the reversal of the loss of environmental resources. As noted in the analysis the institutional structure to achieving the goal has been put in place in 1995 in the form of the Environment Public Authority (EPA). The extent to which EPA will be able to achieve the desired goal will depend to a large extent on cooperation with various line ministries and functioning industries in the private sector. However, given the nature of the economic activity in the country and its reliance on the oil industry it is a real challenge whether EPA will be able to influence the currently high levels of both the energy use indicator and the carbon dioxide emissions are quite high.

Annex Table (A.1): The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs): A Summary

Goals/Targets	Indicators
Goal 1: Eradicate Extreme Poverty and Hunger.	
Target 1: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than one dollar a day	1. Proportion of population below \$1 per person per day. 2. Poverty gap ratio. 3. Share of poorest quintile in national consumption.
Target 2: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger.	4. Prevalence on underweight under-five years of age children. 5. Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption.
Goal 2: Achieve Universal Primary Education.	
Target 3: Ensure that by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling.	6. Net enrolment ratio in primary education. 7. Proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5. 8. Literacy rate of 15-24 years old.
Goal 3: Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women.	
Target 4: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education by 2005 and at all levels of education no later than 2015.	9. Ratio of girls to boys in primary, secondary and tertiary education. 10. Ratio of literate females to males of 15-24 years of age. 11. Share of women in wage employment in non-agricultural sector. 12. Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament.
Goal 4: Reduce Child Mortality.	
Target 5: Reduce by two third, between 1990 and 2015, the under-five mortality rate.	13. Under-five mortality rate. 14. Infant mortality rate. 15. Proportion of 1 year old children immunized against measles.
Goal 5: Improve Maternal Health.	
Target 6: Reduce by three quarters, between 1990 and 2015, the maternal mortality rate.	16. Maternal mortality rate. 17. Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel.
Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and other Diseases.	
Target 7: Have halted by 2015, and begun to reverse, the spread of HIV/AIDS.	18. HIV prevalence among 15-24 years old pregnant women. 19. Condom use contraceptive prevalence rate. 20. Number of children orphaned by HIV/AIDS.
Target 8: Have halted by 2015, and begun to reverse, the incidence of malaria and other major diseases.	21. Prevalence and death rates associated with malaria. 22. Proportion of population in malaria risk areas using effective malaria prevention and treatment measures. 23. Prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis. 24. Proportion of TB cases detected and cured under directly observed treatment short course (DOTS).
Goal 7: Ensure Environmental Sustainability.	
Target 9. Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources.	25. Proportion of land area covered by forest. 26. Land area protected to maintain biological diversity. 27. GDP per unit of energy use (as a proxy for energy efficiency). 28. Per capita carbon dioxide emissions.
Target 10: Halve, by 2015, the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water.	29. Proportion of population using solid fuels. 30. Proportion of population with sustainable access to an improved water source.
Target 11: By 2002, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers.	31. Proportion of people with access to improved sanitation. 32. Proportion of people with access to secure tenure.
Goal 8: Develop a Global Partnership for Development.	Indicators subject to further refinements.

Source: UN (2002), Implementation of the United Nations Millennium Declaration: Report of the Secretary-General; report no. A/57/270; www.un.org.

Annex Table (A.2) : The Millennium Development Indicators for Kuwait

Indicator	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002
1. Proportion of population below \$1 per person per day.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2. Poverty-gap ratio.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
3. Share of poorest quintile in national consumption.	7.99	-	-	-	-	-	-	8.45	-	-
4. Prevalence of underweight U-5 children.										
5. Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption.										
6. Net enrolment ratio in primary education.	-	87.39	87.45	88.02	87.30	89.07	88.82	85.84	-	-
7. Proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5.	-	94.80	96.30	93.12	97.90	94.78	96.06	96.38	97.94	95.55
8. Literacy rate of 15-24 years of age.	98.40	98.60	98.80	99.00	99.10	99.34	99.50	99.65	99.74	99.82
9. Ratio of girls to boys in education:										
(a) primary	99.7	100.6	100.3	99.9	99.5	99.7	99.6	100.5		
(b) secondary	109.9	109.1	108.0	107.2	109.8	112.7	116.7	120.2		
(c) tertiary	216.1	213.5	211.6	202.2	208.9	353.8	209.0	227.5		
10. Ratio of literate females to males of 15-24 years of age.	97.6	99.0	98.7	99.1	99.3	99.2	99.1	99.2	99.3	99.5
11. Share of women in wage employment in non-employment sector.	31.0	31.4	31.9	32.3	32.9	33.8	34.5	34.7	35.7	37.3
12. Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
13. Under-5 mortality rate (per 1000 live births).	13.0	14.0	12.5	13.5	15.3	12.1	11.4	11.3	11.5	-
14. Infant mortality rate (per 1000 live births).	11.2	12.0	10.7	11.4	12.5	10.1	9.1	8.8	9.5	-
15. Proportion of one year old children immunized against measles.	-	95.4	98.0	99.0	95.4	99.0	95.7	99.1	-	-
16. Maternal mortality rate .	0	0	7.6	7.6	11.4	3.9	3.9	0	0	-
17. Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel.	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100
18. HIV prevalence among 15-24 year old pregnant women.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
19. Condom use rate of contraceptive prevalence rate.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
20. Number of children orphaned by HIV/AIDS.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
21. Prevalence and death rates associated with malaria.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
22. Proportion of population in malaria risk areas using effective malaria prevention and treatment measures.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
23. Prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis (TB).	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
24. Proportion of TB cases detected and cured under DOTS.	0	0	0	0	0	0	23	25	22	31
25. Proportion of land area covered by forest.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
26. Land area protected to maintain biological diversity.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
27. GDP per unit of energy use(kg per \$1000 of GDP).	355	397	418	516	549	570	523	-	-	-
28. Per capita carbon dioxide emissions (tons per capita).	18.8	22.1	27.1	26.6	24.8	26.1	-	-	-	-
29. Proportion of population using solid fuels.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
30. Proportion of population with sustainable access to an improved water source.	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100
31. Proportion of urban population with access to improved sanitation.	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100
32. Proportion of people with access to secure tenure.	-	-	-	-	-	-	99.8	-	-	-
33. Aid/GNP ratio	1.4	0.1	1.6	1.1	0.6	0.8	1.1	0.4	0.6	-

Sources: see annex table (A.3).

Annex Table (A.3): Millennium Development Indicators for Kuwait: Sources of Information

Indicator	Source
1. Proportion of population below \$1 per person per day.	Own calculations based on Ministry of Planning, (2002), Household Income and Expenditure Survey: 1999/2000; Kuwait
2. Poverty-gap ratio.	Own calculations based Ministry of Planning, (2002), Household Income and Expenditure Survey 1999/2000; Kuwait.
3. Share of poorest quintile in national consumption.	Own calculations based on Ministry of Planning, (2002), Household Income and Expenditure Survey 1999/2000; Kuwait.
4. Prevalence of underweight U-5 children.	Not available.
5. Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption.	Not Available.
6. Net enrolment ratio in primary education.	Ministry of Education, Annual Report on Educational Statistics; various issues.
7. Proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5.	Ministry of Education, Annual Report on Educational Statistics, various issues.
8. Literacy rate of 15-24 years of age.	Ministry of Planning, Basic Features of Population and Labor Force as of 30 th June ; various issues.
9. Ratio of girls to boys in education.	Ministry of Education, Annual Report on Educational Statistics; various issues.
10. Ratio of literate females to males of 15-24 years of age.	Ministry of Planning, Basic Features of Population and Labor Force as of 30 th June; various issues.
11. Share of women in wage employment in non-employment sector.	Public Authority for Civil Information, unpublished data.
12. Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament.	Common knowledge.
13. Under-5 mortality rate.	Ministry of Health, Annual Report on Health in Kuwait; various issues.
14. Infant mortality rate.	Ministry of Health, Annual Report on Health in Kuwait; various issues.
15. Proportion of one year old children immunized against measles.	Ministry of Health, Annual Report on Health in Kuwait; various issues.
16. Maternal mortality rate.	Ministry of Health, Annual Report on Health in Kuwait; various issues.
17. Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel.	Ministry of Health, Annual Report on Health in Kuwait; various issues.
18. HIV prevalence among 15-24 year old pregnant women.	UNAIDS et al (2002), Kuwait: Epidemiological Fact Sheets on HIV/AIDS and Sexually Transmitted Infections: 2002 Update; www.unaids.org
19. Contraceptive prevalence rate.	
20. Number of children orphaned by HIV/AIDS.	UNAIDS et al (2002), Kuwait: Epidemiological Fact Sheets on HIV/AIDS and Sexually Transmitted Infections: 2002 Update; www.unaids.org
21. Prevalence and death rates associated with malaria.	
22. Proportion of population in malaria risk areas using effective malaria prevention and treatment measures.	
23. Prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis (TB).	
24. Proportion of TB cases detected and cured under DOTS.	Ministry of Health (unpublished data)
25. Proportion of land area covered by forest.	http://geodata.grid.nep.ch
26. Land area protected to maintain biological diversity.	
27. GDP per unit of energy use.	http://geodata.grid.unep.ch
28. Per capita carbon dioxide emissions (tons per capita).	http://geodata.grid.unep.ch
29. Proportion of population using solid fuels.	
30. Proportion of population with sustainable access to an improved water source.	Derived.
31. Proportion of urban population with access to improved sanitation.	Derived.
32. Proportion of people with access to secure tenure.	Public Authority for Civil Information, unpublished data.
33. Aid/GNP ratio	Arab Fund for Economic and Social Development, et al, (2002); Unified Arab Economic Report 2002, Kuwait.

Annex Table (A.4): Development Indicators in Selected World Regions in 2000

Indicator	Unit of Measurement	Developing Countries	Middle East and North Africa	Kuwait
1. Proportion of population below \$1 per person per day.	Percentage	23	2	0
2. Poverty-gap ratio.	Percentage	6.9 w	0.4	0
3. Share of poorest quintile in national consumption.	Percentage	2 w	-	5.9
4. Prevalence of underweight U-5 children.	Percentage	28	10 wa	-
5. Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption.	Percentage	17	7 wa	-
6. Net enrolment ratio in primary education.	Percentage	82	76 as	85.8
7. Proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5.	Percentage	-	-	96.4
8. Literacy rate of 15-24 years of age.	Percentage	84	79 as	99.7
9. Ratio of girls to boys in education:	Ratio			
(a) Primary		0.87	0.84	1.01
(b) Secondary		0.82	0.74	1.20
(c) Tertiary		0.75	1.10	2.28
10. Ratio of literate females to males of 15-24 years of age.	Ratio	0.93	-	0.99
11. Share of women in wage employment in non-employment sector.	Percentage	46	21	34.7
12. Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament.	Percentage	14 w	4 wa	0
13. Under-5 mortality rate.	Per 1000 live births	91	46 na	11.8
14. Infant mortality rate.	Per 1000 live births	63	39 na	9
15. Proportion of one year old children immunized against measles.	Percentage	69	91 na	100
16. Maternal mortality rate.	Per 100000 live births	440	230 wa	0
17. Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel.	Percentage	53	64 wa	100
18. HIV prevalence among 15-24 year old pregnant women.	Percentage	1.1	0.01 wa	0
19. Contraceptive prevalence rate.	Percentage	7 w	-	-
20. Number of children orphaned by HIV/AIDS.	Millions	13.4	-	0
21. Prevalence and death rates associated with malaria.	Per 100000 children below 4	166	26 wa	0
22. Proportion of population in malaria risk areas using effective malaria prevention and treatment measures.	Percentage	-	-	0
23. Prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis (TB).	Per 100000 population	147	27 na	0
24. Proportion of TB cases detected and cured under DOTS.	Percentage detected (cured)	27 (80)*	-	0
25. Proportion of land area covered by forest.	Percentage	29.6*	-	0
26. Land area protected to maintain biological diversity.	Percentage	9.5*	-	0
27. Energy use (Kg oil equivalent per \$1 GDP)	Kg per \$1000 GDP	228*	-	523
28. Per capita carbon dioxide emissions (tons per capita).	Metric tons per capita	1.13*	-	26.3
29. Proportion of population using solid fuels.	Percentage	75	40	-
30. Proportion of population with sustainable access to an improved water source.	Percentage	82 w	90 na	-
31. Proportion of urban population with access to improved sanitation.	Percentage	85 w	97 wa	100
32. Proportion of people with access to secure tenure.	Percentage of urban population	62	-	99.8
33. Aid/GNP ratio	Percentage	0.22 OECD	-	0.4

Source: UN (2002), Implementation of the United Nations Millennium Declaration; report no. A/57/270; www.un.org.

Notes: - means not available; * means region not specified; as: means Arab States; w: means world; na: means North Africa; wa: means Western Asia.